

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH
THURSDAY OCTOBER 17, 2024**

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a virtual meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held at 10:02 a.m. on October 17, 2024. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Liz Fishback, Bobby Wilson, Bob Palmosina and Sean Luther. Kim Lucas joined at 10:04 a.m. Present from staff were David Onorato, Chris Holt, Christopher Speers, Jodi Hart, Matt Jendrzewski, Scott McNaugher, David Perry, Bob Wilson, Karla Turzak, Hanna Rupenski and Patricia Konesky. Also present were Nathan Clark of Buchanan, Ingersoll & Rooney, Bob LaMar of Gateway Towers Condominium Association, Denise Moschak and Alison Keating.

MINUTES

Ms. Fishback reminded all that there was no Board Meeting in September.

Ms. Fishback asked for approval of the minutes from the August 15, 2024, meeting.

Upon motion by Mr. Palmosina and seconded by Mr. Luther, the minutes were approved as follows: Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any public comments.

Mr. LaMar a board president of the Gateway Towers Condominium Association spoke regarding enforcement in the area of the Ft. Duquesne and Commonwealth Place. He stated that he has seen illegal parking at crosswalks, fire hydrants, other clearly marked no parking areas and he stated that he has heard conflicting reports from Parking Authority personnel regarding their ability to write violations for those codes. Mr. LaMar asked if he could get some clarity on the enforcement authority.

Ms. Fishback thanked Mr. LaMar for his inquiry and deferred to Mr. Onorato to respond.

Mr. Onorato asked Mr. LaMar to leave his contact information and that he will respond to him.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any additional members of the public wishing to comment.

There were none.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Onorato updated the Board on the new Residential Permit Portal advising that it is live. He advised that we are continuing to work through some minor technical issues.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority received our latest bond rating status from Standard And Poor's and we retain our status of A-1 Stable.

Mr. Onorato advised that working with DOMI we requested the City Finance Director to approve the rates for the new Lawrenceville Mobility Enhancement District which will be implemented in the 3400 to the 4600 blocks of Butler Street. He advised that meter rates and enforcement hours will be increased if approved and is anticipated to begin in November.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Finance Report, noting that in September of 2024 revenues were \$37.4 million compared to 2023's \$35.5 million which is an increase but still down from the 2019 base year of \$43.8 million. He advised that both meter and garage receipts increased this month and in total revenues are up approximately 5.4 %. He advised that September 2024 of \$4.3 million compared to September 2023 of \$4.2 million shows revenues down slightly.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Meter Violation Report, noting that ticket issuance has increased by approximately 2,000 tickets issued for the year, which is notes is roughly the amount of the tickets issued by mail for the month. He noted that the report shows that there were zero tickets issued for residential permit violations as he reminded that tickets have not been issued while we were transferring to a new portal. He stated that we do anticipate the number of tickets being issued will increase as we have begun to enforce now that the portal is operating. Mr. Onorato advised that meter violations and street cleaning violations account for 70 % of all violations this month.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Court Report, advising that 2024 revenues through September are \$7.2 million with expenses at \$1.602 million slightly down from \$1.620 million from 2023. He advised that the projected revenue to the city is \$5.18 million year to date through September noting that we anticipate obtaining this year's budgeted amount of just over \$9 million.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Garage Transient and Net Revenue Graph which shows that the first 5 months of 2024 were above 2023's pace and that we will continue to monitor.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Garage Day and Evening/Weekend Transactions Report, which show trends that are consistent throughout the years and if there are any abnormalities.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Downtown Housing Lease Report, which shows the number of leases purchased by Downtown residents, with the most being in Smithfield/Liberty, First Avenue, Grant Street and Mellon Square garages, account for 380 of the total space and 73 % of the total Downtown Housing Leases. He advised that at the beginning of the year there were 491 leases and through September there is a total of 521. He advised that these leaseholders are required to

show proof of residency in the Downtown area and then they receive a discount on their monthly lease equal to the city parking tax.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Quarterly Meter Revenue Report, stating that the total meter revenue year-to-date is \$15 million of which 1.5 % is paid by coin, 35 % by credit card and 63 % by mobile payment.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Pay-by-Phone Report, advising that ParkMobile had ninety-seven percent of all mobile transactions with the remaining was split between the other three mobile vendors with the revenues being ParkMobile \$8.4 million year-to-date and the other 3 vendors are approximately \$200,000 combined year-to-date.

RESOLUTION NO. 27 OF OCTOBER 2024, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING FREE PARKING FOR TRANSIENT CUSTOMERS ON “SMALL BUSINESS SATURDAY” NOVEMBER 30, 2024, AT ALL AUTHORITY-OWNED METERED LOTS AND ON-STREET METERS was read by Ms. Fishback and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that this practice has been occurring for at least the last 5 years if not longer to offer free parking for transient customers at on-street meters and in surface lots to encourage customers to participate in Small Business Saturday.

Mr. Luther asked if we were aware of any other publicly affiliated operators of parking garages that are requested to take the same action, specifically the URA or SEA owned garages or lots.

Mr. Onorato responded that this resolution only pertains to on-street meters, not garages, and that the Authority is the only entity from the organizations that he mentioned. that has on-street meters. He stated that they may have surface lots, but he believes that the Parking Authority is the only one that offers free parking in our surface lots.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Lucas and seconded by Mr. Wilson, Resolution No. 27 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 28 OF OCTOBER 2024, “A RESOLUTION RATIFYING ADDITIONAL EMERGENCY SERVICE CONTRACTORS FOR THE REMEDIATION AND REPAIR NEEDS DUE TO THE VEHICLE FIRE DAMAGE AT FIRST AVENUE GARAGE AND STATION, was read by Mr. Luther and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that they had previously authorized the initial costs for the engineers to determine the amount of damages and the necessary shoring that was required while the repairs were being made at the First Avenue Garage resulting from a vehicle fire. He advised that it has been determined through core testing of concrete and visual tests of electrical conduit it is now know that the total repair costs are a total of \$79,436.00, representing several vendors as mentioned in the resolution.

Ms. Fishback asked if the Authority has insurance to cover incidents such as this and depending on the nature of the fire could insurance go after the car owner.

Mr. Onorato responded that we do have insurance for this type of occurrence and that we have been communicating with our insurance carrier and noted that they have been in touch with the vehicle owner and their insurance company. He advised that our insurance deductible is \$25,000 and advised that we will be submitting a claim for damages.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Palmosina, Resolution No. 28 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 29 OF OCTOBER 2024, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO EXTEND ENFORCEMENT HOURS AT THE FIVE (5) METERED LOTS IN THE SOUTH SIDE, was read by Mr. Wilson and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the current enforcement hours in the South Side Parking Enhancement District is Thursday through Saturday night until 12 midnight and Saturday nights until 2:00 a.m. and the residential permit parking enforcement, which borders the PED, is occurring until midnight. He advised that we would like to be consistent and be more efficient in the

enforcement of those areas and make the enforcement of the surface lots 24-hours Monday through Saturday and until 3:00 a.m. on Sunday morning. He advised that 2 of those 5 lots already have cameras mounted in them and we anticipate expanding that program into other lots in the area. He stated that so we can stay consistent, so enforcement hours are not changing on a daily basis, we would like to see these 5 surface lots be approved for enforcement 24-hours a day Monday through Saturday and until 3:00 a.m. on Sundays.

Ms. Lucas asked if there are time limits posted in the lots and if the pricing is dynamic. She stated that she agrees with people being able to park as long as they want as long as they are paying appropriately for it.

Mr. Onorato advised that the cost in the lots is \$1.50 per hour and Thursday through Sunday from 6:00 pm to 3:00 a.m. it is \$3.00 per hour, mirroring the PED rates.

Ms. Lucas asked what it would take to change this as she believes that you would want a lower rate in your lots to encourage vehicles to park in the lots rather than on-street.

Mr. Onorato responded that we could lower the lot rates, but what we found out is that the utilization during the PED hours is highly utilized in both lots and on-street. He stated that He would consider increasing the street rates and not lowering the lot rates because the demand is there. He stated that we can look into this.

Mr. Luther asked for the timeline on the installation of the automatic camera enforcement for the remaining lots that would be impacted by this.

Mr. Onorato responded that the pilot has been successful, and we are anticipating issuing an RFP by the end of the year to identify which surface lots we can extend the pilot to and we anticipate it to be about 15 additional lots.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Palmosina, Resolution No. 29 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 30 OF OCTOBER 2024, "A RESOLUTION RATIFYING AN EMERGENCY PROCUREMENT FOR CONTRACTING SERVICES NEEDED FOR FIRE STRUCTURE REMEDIATION AT THE FIRST AVENUE GARAGE AND STATION, was read by Ms. Fishback and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato stated that we are requesting to purchase one tenant riding sweeper to add to

our existing maintenance fleet for our garages. He advised that the Authority maintains the maintenance of our garages and this gives the attendants the necessary tools and equipment to properly clean and maintain the facility's surface level and decks. He advised that we will be using the Co-Stars purchasing program to make the purchase at a no-to-exceed cost of \$57,640 with funds being taken from the 2024 Capital Improvements Fund.

Ms. Lucas asked Mr. Onorato to elaborate on the identification of this need for this additional vehicle as she stated she recalled signing off on vehicle acquisitions early this year and wanted to know if they should anticipate additional purchases throughout the rest of the year.

Mr. Onorato responded that this is the first unit of this type that we are asking to purchase this year, and we will not be purchasing this type of vehicle at all the rest of the year. He stated that we previously asked for approval to purchase fleet EV charging vehicles.

Ms. Lucas asked if the Authority attempts to obtain any grants for vehicle purchases, as she is aware that the City has gotten grants for vehicles that use certain types of fuel.

Ms. Onorato responded that we have not applied for any grants for vehicle purchase, but that we have applied for and received grants for the EV charging stations. He stated that he is not sure that there are any types of grants for these types of vehicles.

Mr. Speers added that these vehicles use liquid propane gas, LPG fueled.

Ms. Lucas stated that there are grants available for a wide variety of vehicle types and she would like to see the Authority to do some analysis on the next round of acquisitions whether or not there may be grants available.

Mr. Onorato stated that this will be looked into at the time of the next vehicle purchase.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Luther and seconded by Ms. Wilson, Resolution No. 30 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 31 OF OCTOBER 2024, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO AWARD A CONTRACT TO MANION PLUMBING, INCORPORATED FOR VALVE REPLACEMENT AT THE SMITHFIELD LIBERTY GARAGE, was read by Mr. Luther and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that repairs were being done to the suppression system in the garage, a life safety feature in the sprinkler system, which required the water to be shut off. He advised that the valve was not able to be turned off due to its deterioration. He advised that we reached out to PWSA to see if they could assist and it was determined that the repair was the responsibility of the Authority and we issued an RFP and we received 4 bids with the lowest being submitted by Manion Plumbing in the amount of \$38,000. He advised that the funds will be taken from the Capital Improvement Fund.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Ms. Wilson, Resolution No. 31 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 32 OF OCTOBER 2024, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT TO REPLACE THE ANTIQUATED LEVEL TWO SINGLE AND DUAL CONNECTOR ELECTRIC VEHICLE (E.V.) CHARGING EQUIPMENT SUPPLYING THE FIFTEEN (15) E.V. PARKING SPACES AT THE FIRST AVENUE GARAGE, was read by Ms. Fishback and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that these stations were installed in First Avenue in 2014 and as quickly as technology changes they could be outdated quickly. He advised that the reporting system of the current technology is currently unavailable to us so we cannot determine the amount of usage. He advised that we are working with ChargePoint on the rip and replace program to replace all of the units at a cost not to exceed \$75,000. He advised that we are also working with Duquesne Light to secure some grant monies and note that they may also have some units that they would be willing to donate which would reduce the overall purchase costs. He stated that if this does happen, he will update the Board.

Mr. Luther asked if we would now update the new charging standards, the Tesla standard that everyone is currently adopting versus the charger that he currently has. He stated that this is the North American standard.

Mr. Speers responded that the new units are universal. He stated that every individual unit that ChargePoint builds is equipped with a gateway and that forced the electrical issue of upgrading our units.

Mr. Luther stated that ChargePoint, in his unprofessional opinion, seems to be a great operator and he is happy they will be the interface on this upgrade.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Wilson and seconded by Mr. Palmosina, Resolution No. 32 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, yes; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 33 OF OCTOBER 2024, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO NEGOTIATE, ENTER INTO AND EFFECTUATE AN AGREEMENT FOR THE PURCHASE AND SALE OF REAL PROPERTY WITH THE SAMUEL J. PATTI AND DEBRA A. PATTI REVOCALBLE LIVING TRUST, was read by Mr. Wilson and considered by the Board.

Ms. Fishback asked if this resolution was sun shined in time for this meeting.

Mr. Onorato responded that it was not in the preliminary packet that was sent to the Board, but it was added just this week. He stated he believes that the Sunshine Act just requires that the meeting be publicly advertised and deferred to the Authority Solicitor.

Mr. Clark responded that this understanding is correct, and an actual agenda is not required.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the Authority owns the lot which has been vacant since its purchase in 1999 and therefore never produced any revenue. He advised that there is a local establishment adjacent to the property who is interested in purchasing the property. He advised that we received support letter from the neighborhood community and the local Councilman for the sale of this property. He advised that the Authority had an appraisal conducted and the market value for the property of 12,070 square feet was determined at \$90,000 and we are looking to enter into a sales agreement with La Primo Coffee Company for the sale of the Liverpool Lot in the Manchester neighborhood.

Ms. Lucas asked if there would be some zoning issues.

Mr. Onorato responded that he does not believe that they will occur any zoning issues due to the way it is currently zoned.

Mr. Wilson asked for clarification on the spelling of the name of the buyer as it is listed with two different spellings in this resolution and he wanted to be sure it was the same entity.

Mr. Onorato responded it was an error and will be corrected in the resolution before signature.

Mr. Wilson asked if this was included in the work that was completed to identify all property owned by the Authority.

Mr. Onorato replied that it was included in the property assessment study and advised that they had been inquiring about the sale of this property for over a year and we had advised them to wait until the results of the study were received. He advised that the study did show that it was to our advantage to sell this property since it is non-revenue producing as well as an expense for the maintenance required.

Mr. Wilson asked if we were aware what the lot would be used for after the sale.

Mr. Onorato advised that it will be used for parking of vehicles for the coffee shop but noted that this was what was discussed in the early discussions but advised that once they own the parcel, they will be able to determine its usage.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any questions or comments.

There were none.

Upon motion by Ms. Fishback and seconded by Mr. Palmosina. Resolution No. 33 of 2024 was approved as follows: Ms. Lucas, abstain; Mr. Wilson, yes; Mr. Palmosina, yes; Mr. Luther, yes; Ms. Fishback, yes.

OLD BUSINESS

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any old business matters to discuss.

There were none.

NEW BUSINESS

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any new business matters to discuss.

Ms. Fishback stated that she wanted to remind members of the public that there is time built into the agenda at the beginning of each meeting and they should not be making public comments in real time on the zoom chat.

Ms. Fishback asked if there were any additional new business matters to discuss.

There were none.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:50 a.m. with all the Board expressing their approval.

APPROVED TO CONTENT

Signed by:
Bobby Wilson

Chairman

ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF MINUTES

Signed by:
[Signature]

Approval